Interpreting Laser Diffraction Results for Non-Spherical Particles

David M. Scott
Advanced Particle Sensors
david.scott@particlesci.com

Horiba Webinar Series – Dec. 10, 2019
Abstract

Particle shape is often overlooked in Laser Diffraction measurements, but it affects the diffraction pattern used to determine particle size distribution (PSD). As a result, laser diffraction instruments tend to report bi-modal PSDs for non-spherical particles, even for samples containing a single size class. Therefore a bi-modal result is ambiguous unless shape is considered.

Equipped with only qualitative knowledge of particle shape, the particle analyst can resolve this inherent ambiguity and even use laser diffraction to measure aspect ratio of non-spherical particles. This webinar explains the origin of this effect, describes how to interpret PSD data in such cases, and demonstrates practical applications for measurements of organic crystals, polymer flakes, bacteria, yeast, and clays.

Outline

1. Brief Review of Laser Diffraction for Spherical Particles
2. Impact of Shape on Laser Diffraction Results
3. The Measurement Dilemma and Its Resolution
4. Interpreting Results for Non-Spherical Particles
5. Application Examples for Real-World Samples
6. References
Benefits of Laser Diffraction

- Fast
- Simple
- Wide range of sizes (less than 100 nm to over 2 mm)
- Requires very little sample (<0.1 g powder, <0.2 mL dispersion)
- Versatile: dispersions, droplets in liquids, sprays, solvents, etc.
- On-line and in-process applications are possible
- Commonly used throughout industry

10 nm  100 nm  1 µm  10 µm  100 µm  1 mm (particle size)
Laser Diffraction (Spherical Particles)

Detector design and scattering model typically assume that particles are spherical

D. M. Scott / Advanced Particle Sensors, “Interpreting Diffraction Results for Non-Spherical Particles”, Horiba Webinar 12/10/19
Particle Size Distribution (PSD)

- Samples of interest usually contain a range (distribution) of particle sizes.
- Laser Diffraction size distributions are typically reported on the basis of particle volume.
- PSDs frequently (but not always) approximate a log-normal distribution, which can be described by a median size and a geometric standard deviation.
- Log-Normal distributions shown on a semi-log graph resemble a Normal distribution that is plotted on linear axes.
Particles Are Often Non-Spherical!

- Sepiolite (clay)
- Kaolinite (clay)
- Polymer flakes
- E Coli
- Crystallized amino acid
- Rods
- Ellipsoids
- Disks

Credit: USGS
Sizing a Non-Spherical Particle

Various definitions of particle size:

- Feret’s diameter (F)
- Minor axis of the projection (S)
- Martin’s diameter (M)
- Equivalent Sphere Diameter, ESD (V)
- etc.

Many applications “assume the spherical cow”, or the ESD (diameter of the sphere with equivalent volume).

Credit: cow photo from USDA.gov

Scott, Industrial Process Sensors (CRC Press, 2008), Fig. 8.1
Diffraction from Rods and Spheroids

Rectangle (rods)

Ellipse (spheroids, disks)

Credit: Adapted from an image by Christophe Finot

Unlike diffraction from a sphere, for rods and disks the intensity depends on the azimuthal angle as well as the polar angle.

Diffraction equations are given by Matsuyama et al. (2000) and Takano et al. (2012)
Alignment in Laminar Flow

- Flow Cells typically operate in laminar flow regime (with $Re << 2000$)
- Velocity across the flow cell has parabolic profile
- The flow aligns the particles (Jeffery 1922) perpendicular to the laser beam, but not necessarily in the same direction.
Integration over Many Particles

The resulting diffraction pattern (light intensity versus scattering angle $\theta$) is a mixture of contributions from the major and minor axes of the particle.
The Result

The observed diffraction signal (intensity versus scattering angle) cannot be described by diffraction from a single sphere.

In general, the instrument reports a bi-modal distribution:

PSD

Vol. %

Size
The Measurement Dilemma

Given a bi-modal or multi-modal result for an unknown material:

- Does the PSD signify that there are different size classes (e.g. primary and aggregate) of quasi-spherical particles?

- Or, does the apparent PSD indicate that non-spherical particles are present?

- How do we interpret PSD results for non-spherical particles?

D. M. Scott / Advanced Particle Sensors, “Interpreting Diffraction Results for Non-Spherical Particles”, Horiba Webinar 12/10/19
Resolving Ambiguity

To solve the dilemma, we only need to know whether or not the particles are approximately spherical.

This information may be known *a priori* (e.g. from crystal habit or particle formation considerations), but it is most often determined by imaging:

- Optical microscopy
- Dynamic Image Analysis
- Scanning Electron Microscopy

If the particles are approximately spherical, the PSD may be reported as usual.
Interpreting PSD Results for Non-Spherical Particles
The Approach – Diffraction Equivalence

Since the diffraction signal cannot be described by diffraction from a single sphere, try a mixture of 2 sizes!

One size (a) represents the particle diameter, and the other (b) represents the length (scaling to wavelength simplifies the math).

The diffraction pattern of a $5\lambda \times 10\lambda$ rod is nearly the same as the pattern from a mixture of $6.1\lambda$ and $10.4\lambda$ spheres.
Interpreting Particle Length

The previous calculation of equivalent diffraction has been repeated for a number of rods of various lengths (b\(\lambda\)).

Numerical results show the diameter of the large sphere (B) is about 10% smaller than the actual rod length (b).

\[ y = 0.8943x \]
\[ R^2 = 0.97101 \]
**Diffraction Equivalence for Spheroids**

The diffraction pattern from a spheroid can also be represented as the combined diffraction from two spheres.

Note: Side lobes cannot be fit accurately with only 2 spheres. Matsuyama et al. (2000) showed a size distribution is needed.

![Prolate spheroid](image)
Estimating Aspect Ratio

Calculations for rods and spheroids show that the aspect ratio \((b/a)\) and the corresponding ratio \((B/A)\) of spheres giving equivalent diffraction appear to be related by a universal curve:

\[
(B / A) = 1.12(b / a)^{0.563}
\]

Given \((B/A)\), the aspect ratio is estimated as \((b / a) = 0.893(B / A)^{1.776}\)
Deconvolution (Fitting)

• Diffraction from mono-sized rods and spheroids can be approximated by combining two or more spheres.

• A range of sphere sizes is required to approximate diffraction from polydisperse samples.

• In most cases, bi-lognormal distributions can be fitted to the observed data, thus deconvolving the length and width contributions.

• Median sizes (a and b) of the two component distributions are related to the median values of the minor and major axes (A and B) of the subject particles.
Bi-Log-Normal Distribution

Bi-Log-Normal distribution is characterized by TWO logarithmic median sizes, TWO logarithmic standard deviations, and the relative contributions of both size components.

This example shows a bi-log-normal distribution fitted to data:

Note: Median size A and B can be approximated directly (without fitting) from the positions of the peaks.
Examples: Rod-Like Particles
Sepiolite

- Sepiolite is a magnesium silicate clay with fibrous structure, used to reinforce materials (e.g. nanocomposites)
- High power sonication disperses the fibers
- Peak associated with the fiber diameter becomes more prevalent as fibers become more dispersed
Sepiolite (Dispersed)

PSD of well-dispersed sepiolite is dominated by the peak associated with diameter

Note: Diffraction theory predicts this effect for infinitely long rods (Bohren & Huffman 1998)

Differential Volume Fraction (%) vs. Size (um)

Diameter

Length

Sonication energy: 300 J/g
Tyrosine Crystals

Crystals are broken by the pump during recirculation (note the reduction in the coarse tail of the distribution over time). No sonication was used in this example.

Tyrosine is an amino acid used in protein synthesis.
Deconvolution of Crystal Data

Bi-modal deconvolution is used to determine the approximate crystal length as a function of time:

\[ y = -0.61x + 9.53 \]

The median crystal length decreases about 0.6 microns per minute during recirculation.
Example: Ellipsoidal Particles
Polymer Flakes

- Median of distribution corresponding to width is 143 µm
- Median of distribution corresponding to length is 406 µm
E Coli

Best fit to PSD is obtained with two size modes

Ratio of the two modes is 1.5, consistent with direct microscopic observation

RMS error 0.128

RI = 1.397+0.01i (Balaev et al. 2002)

D. M. Scott / Advanced Particle Sensors, “Interpreting Diffraction Results for Non-Spherical Particles”, Horiba Webinar 12/10/19
Yeast

Deconvolution of coarse peak yields 5.2 x 7.8 µm, close to observed size

Origin of PSD peak at 1 µm is unclear (scattering from cell wall??)

Assume RI=1.52+0.01i
Examples: Plate-Like Particles
Dispersion of Kaolinite

- Kaolinite was dispersed in an organic solvent with a high shear mixer
- Samples were drawn at regular intervals of time
- Power number of the rotor was used to estimate the total specific energy for each sample
Deconvolution of Kaolinite PSD

Example of deconvolution of ESD PSD obtained with kaolinite
Dispersion of Kaolinite

- Results of deconvolving the ESD PSD data at each specific energy
- Component due to diameter decreases in size: plates are breaking
- Component due to thickness remains constant: there appears to be little exfoliation of the plates above 100 J/g

D. M. Scott / Advanced Particle Sensors, “Interpreting Diffraction Results for Non-Spherical Particles”, Horiba Webinar 12/10/19
Conclusions

• Laser Diffraction typically gives bi-modal results for non-spherical particles, especially for \((b/a)>1.5\).

• Interpretation of multi-modal PSDs requires *a priori* knowledge of particle shape, but detailed information is not necessary to monitor particle size and aspect ratio.

• Bi-lognormal distributions can be fit to PSD data for a variety of industrial particles, yielding approximate distributions of particle length and width (or width and thickness).

• A universal curve has been discovered that shows the true aspect ratio varies as a power of the ratio of diameters \((B/A)\).

• Finally, deconvolution of apparent PSD allows us to estimate aspect ratio and true dimensions of non-spherical particles.
References


- C.F. Bohren and D.R. Huffman, Absorption and Scattering of Light by Small Particles (Wiley 1998), p.211.


Credits

- Cow image from USDA.gov is in the public domain.
- Rectangular diffraction pattern is adapted from an image by Christophe Finot and used under license CC-BY-SA shown at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/1.0/legalcode
- Kaolinite image from from United States Geological Survey (Bulletin 1614, 1985) is in the public domain